

# Continuous Delivery at Wix The motivations for CI/CD/TDD, implementation and impact Yoav Abrahami

INTERNATIONAL SOFTWARE DEVELOPMENT CONFERENCE

gotocon•com

#### About Wix

**X**WIX



ΛIX

0\_0



#### About Wix



### Wix Initial Architecture

#### Server

**XWX** 

Public Sites Serving Sites Editing API User Authentication User Media upload, searches Public Media upload, management, searches Template Galleries management

# Database Wix Sites WixML Pages **User Authentication Users** Media Public Media **Template Galleries**

ē, ē

#### XWX

### Wix Initial Architecture



- Tomcat, Hibernate, Custom web framework
  - Everything generated from HBM files
  - Built for fast development
  - Statefull login (tomcat session), EHCache, File uploads
  - Not considering performance, scalability, fast feature rollout, testing
  - It reflected the fact that we didn't really know what is our business
  - Yoav A. "it is great for a first stage start-up, but you will have to replace it within 2 years"

ē ē

 Nadav A, after two years - "you were right, however, you failed to mention how hard it's gonna be"

#### XWX

### Wix Initial Architecture



#### What we have learned

- Don't worry about 'building it right from the start' you won't
- You are going to replace stuff you are building in the initial stages of a startup or any project
- Be ready to do it
- Get it up to customers as fast as you can. Get feedback. Evolve.
- Our mistake was not planning for gradual re-write
- Build for gradual re-write as you learn the problems and find the right solutions





#### Two years passed



- We learned what our business is building websites
- We started selling premium websites



### Two years passed

#### Our architecture evolved Billing Billing (Tomcat) DB We added a separate Billing segment We moved static file storage and HTTP serving to a Server separate instance DB (Tomcat) But we started seeing problems statics Media (Lighttpd) Updates to our server imposed complete wix downtime storage

Our static storage reached 500 GByte of small files, the limit of Bash scripts

🟋 WíX

۲

۲

- The codebase became large and entangled. Feature rollout became harder over time, requiring longer and longer manual regression
  - Strange full-table scans queries generated by Hibernate, which we still have no idea what code is responsible for...
- Statefull user sessions required a lot of memory and a statefull load balancer

### Two years passed

#### Our architecture evolved Billing (Tomcat) We added a separate Billing segment We moved static file storage and HTTP serving to a Server separate instance (Tomcat) But we started seeing problems statics Updates to our server imposed complete wix downtime (Lighttpd)

Our static storage reached 500 GByte of small files, the limit of Bash scripts

🗶 WIX

۲

۲

- The codebase became large and entangled. Feature rollout became harder over time, requiring longer and longer manual regression
  - Strange full-table scans queries generated by Hibernate, which we still have no • idea what code is responsible for...
- Statefull user sessions required a lot of memory and a statefull load balancer



### X WIX

## Motivations for CI/CD/TDD

- We were working traditional waterfall
- With fear of change
  - It is working, why touch it?
  - Uploading a release means downtime and bugs!
- With low product quality
  - Want to risk fixing this bug? Who knows what may break?
- With slow development velocity
  - From "I have a great new product idea" to "it is working" takes too match time
- With tradition enterprise development lifecycle
  - Three months of a "VERSION" development and QA
  - Six months of crisis mode cleaning bugs and stabilizing system



## Wix's CI/CD/TDD model

- Abandon "VERSION" paradigm move feature centric life
- Make small and frequent release as soon as possible
  - Today we release about 10 times a day, gaining velocity
- Empower the developer

😤 WíX

- The developer is responsible from product idea to 10,000 active users
- Remove every obstacle in the developer's path
- Big cultural change from waterfall affects the whole company
- Automate everything CI/CD/TDD
  - CI Continuous Integration
  - CD Continuous Delivery / Deployment
  - TDD Test Driven Development
- Measure Everything
  - A/B test every new feature
  - Monitor real KPIs (business, not CPU)



### **Test Driven Development**

#### • TDD workflow

🗶 WiX

- Definition: First write a test-case, then write the code for the test to pass and then refactor the code
- My Definition: write the code and tests at the same time. During development, run only tests! (don't write Main(), deploy to app server, etc).
- Code vs Testing Code
  - Developers invest in refactoring the production code to have high quality.
  - But the test code is just that something we ^\$@&\*@# ~\*@ must live with.
  - Test code is as important as production code. We invest in modeling it, refactoring it and building the tools to make it clear and maintainable.



#### **Test Driven Development**

- What people think is the impact on development
  - TDD slows down development
  - With TDD we write more code (product + test code).
- Actual impact on development
  - We development faster

🗶 WiX

- Removes fear of change
- Easier to enter some-else's project
- Do we really need QA? (Yes, they code tests)
- 10-30% slower, 45-90% less bugs
- Considerably faster time to fix bugs
- Current Test Count (U-Tests + IT-Tests) over 6500



- Server side Java, C Automated U-Tests and IT-Tests
  - U-Tests mockito, Hamcrest, JUnit, Wix enhancements (logging, builders, etc).
  - IT-Tests full embedded mode support, including embedded MySQI, embedded Jetty, embedded MongoDB, etc.
  - All tests run on every code check-in

#### • Client side – JS - Automated U-Tests and working on Automating GUI-Tests

- U-Tests Jasmine, Testacle distributed parallel U-Test runner integrated into IDE and Maven
- GUI Tests

😤 WIX

- Working on Selenium, with embedded RC and external grid
- Still a large manual effort
- U-Tests run on every code check-in
- Lint (custom profile) run on every code check-in



#### • U-Tests

XWX

- Test the business logic of the application
- No Dependencies
- IT-Tests
  - Test the integration with different libraries (inbound or outbound)
  - Tests if we use the library correctly
- Learning Test
  - Tests used to learn how to use a certain library



0\_0

- U-Test example (as complex as it gets)
  - Setup: Custom Junit Runner and mocking
  - White Box test

🗶 WiX

```
@Test
public void testRenderingNoDebug() {
    when (scriptSource.getScriptsList(DebugMode.nodebug))
        .thenReturn(ImmutableMultimap.<String, Url>builder()
             .putAll("core", new Url(CORE1 JS), new Url(CORE2 JS))
             .putAll("main", new Url(MAIN1 JS), new Url(MAIN2 JS))
             .build());
    when (scriptSource.getScriptsList(DebugMode.nodebug))
        .thenReturn(ImmutableMultimap.<String, Url>builder()
             .putAll("core", new Url(CORE3 JS))
             .putAll("main", new Url(MAIN3_JS))
             .build());
    Renderable renderable = scriptsRenderer.renderScripts(DebugMode.nodebug);
    assertThat(renderable.toString(), allOf(
                not(containsString("<script type=\"text/javascript\" src=\"" +</pre>
                     CORE1 JS + "\ </script>")),
                not(containsString("<script type=\"text/javascript\" src=\"" +</pre>
                     CORE2 JS + "\"></script>")),
                not(containsString("<script type=\"text/javascript\" src=\"" +</pre>
                    MAIN1 JS + "\ </script>")),
                not(containsString("<script type=\"text/javascript\" src=\"" +</pre>
                    MAIN2 JS + "\"></script>")),
                containsString("<script type=\"text/javascript\" src=\"" +</pre>
                     MAIN3 JS + "\"></script>"),
                containsString("<script type=\"text/javascript\" src=\"" +</pre>
                    MAIN3 JS + "\"></script>"),
                not(containsString("${"))));
```



• IT-Test example (as complex as it gets)

🈤 WIX

- Setup: embedded MySQL, migrations, embedded Jetty, testDao
- Black Box test Test over HTTP (Json RPC in this case) to DB.

```
@Test
public void renderWebHtmlUsingRpcPositive() throws IOException {
    Document document = buildSampleDocument();
    testWebSiteDao.saveOrUpdate(defaultSite 1()
                .withDocumentJson(siteDigester.serializeDocument(document))
                .withWixDataJson("{}")
                .build());
    Route route1 = defaultRoute("www", "/")
                .withIdInApp(siteId 1.getId())
                .withApplicationType(ApplicationType.Flash)
                .build();
    Route route2 = defaultRoute("m", "/")
                .withIdInApp(siteId 2.getId())
                .withApplicationType(ApplicationType.HtmlMobile)
                .build();
    RenderResponse render = remoteWebHtmlRemoteRenderer.render(defaultRequest())
                .withMetaSite(defaultMetaSite(metaSiteId, route1, route2))
                .withRoute(route1)
                .withPath("/")
                .build());
    assertThat(render.getHeadContent().render(), containsString(FAVICON JPG));
        assertThat(render.getBodyContent().render(), allOf(containsString(PAGE DATA ID 1),
                containsString(PAGE 1),
                containsString(PAGE 2)));
```



### Guidelines for successful TDD

- Tests should run on project checkout to a random computer.
  - No dependencies on anything installed
- Tests that cannot be debugged on a developer machine will never consistently run for any period of time
- Tests should run fast
- Tests have to be readable
  - They are the project spec
- Fixture is evil!

🗶 WíX

CI/CD @ Wix – Release Process

- During development (on developers machine)
  - Maven (Snapshot), one Trunk
  - Compile Unit Tests Embedded ITs
- On code check-in
  - TeamCity, Maven (Snapshot), Artifactory
  - Compile Unit Tests Embedded ITs Dev Repo
- Mark as RC

🟋 WíX

- Lifecycle, TeamCity, Maven (release), Artifactory
- Compile Unit Tests Embedded ITs RC Repo
- Staging (when needed)
  - Chix, Chef, Sous-Chef, Artifactory, New Relic, App-Info
  - Deploy Staging Self Tests Monitor QA Tests
- Deploy to production
  - Chef, Artifactory, Sous-Chef, New Relic, App-Info
  - Deploy Production > Self Tests > Monitor



A/B Test

#### How does it works – CD Practices

#### • Backwards and Forwards compatible

- Each component has to function with latest, next or prior version of other components (including DBs)
- Gradual Deployment & Self-Test
  - Deploy new version to one server and perform self-test. If it passes, continue deployment to other servers.
- Feature Toggle
  - Open a new feature by feature toggle configuration
- A/B Testing

🗶 WiX

- Open a new feature to a percent of your users. Is it better?
- Exception Classification
  - What exceptions are real errors? What do you care about?
- Small Development Iterations
  - Release frequent small pieces of functionality



### **Gradual Deployment**

Assume two components A 1.1 B 1.1 B 1.1 We shutdown one and install on it the A 1.1 new version. It is not active yet B 1.2 Do self test B 1.1 Activate the new server it is passes self test A 1.1 B 1.2 Continue deploying the other servers, a few at a time, checking each one with B 1.2 A 1.1 self test

0\_0

XWX

۲

۲

- ۲

Backward and Forward compatible

• Assume two components

**X**WIX



• We release a new version of one



• Now Rollback the other...









### Feature Toggle

- Everyone develops on the Trunk
  - It's the developer responsibility not to break anything (requires TDD, CI)
- Every piece of code can get to production at anytime
  - Release of something done by another developer
- What about

😤 WiX

- Incomplete features?
- Not tested / validated features?
- Feature Toggle to the rescue
  - Unused new code can go to production no harm done
  - Used new code goes with a guard use new or old code by feature toggle
- Feature toggle by
  - Static configuration on the server
  - User open a feature to selected users
  - Any other rule you need



## A/B Test

• When we open a new feature

🗶 WIX

- It may be production with Feature Toggle
- It may be a new deployment
- We open the new feature to a certain % of users
  - Define KPIs to check if the new feature is better or worse
  - If it is better, we keep it
  - If worse, we check why and improve
  - If we find flaws, the impact is just for % of our users (kind of Feature Toggle)
- An interesting site effect on product
- How many times did you have the conversion "what is better"?
  - Put the menu on top / on the side
  - If checkout getting inconsistent do an error or do a best effort (e.g. Amazon)?
- Well, how about building both and A/B Testing?



### **Exception Classification**

#### • Every application has errors.

🗶 WIX

- Some are important, some not so
  - Login failure vs "table not found in DB"
- We classify exception by
  - Business errors caused by user behavior
  - System errors preventing our service
  - Level Fatal, Error, Warning or Recoverable

#### • The errors are tracked on app-info and monitoring

Usage Summary							
Total Calls	37350	39					
Total Successfull calls	37262	85					
Throughput	866.9	rpm					
Average Response Time	8.4 mS	iec					
Error Rate	0.00 %	6					
System Errors	5270/	0/14/39					
Business Errors	3256/0/175/0						
	LUSE						
c.w.d.s.DocumentService.getDataNode	Rolling	2,911	3.3 mSec	29.2 mSec	0/0/0/0	0/0/0/0	ě_ě
c.w.h.e.s.HtmlEditorService.cloneDocument	Rolling Last	1,985 0	657.8 mSec	23,286.4 mSec	0/0/7/14	27 <b>/0/0/0</b>	
c.w.e.e.w.MobileDocumentController.clone2	Rolling Last	1,985 0	658.2 mSec -	23,286.8 mSec -	0/0/7/14	27 <b>/0/0/0</b> -	WiX

COM

### **Small Development Iterations**

- No Waterfall
- No Scrum

🗶 WIX

- No Iterations
- No large documents
- Build something small
- When it is ready, deploy it
  - Measure it
  - Then fix it
  - Again
  - And again, until Dev, Product and Customers are happy
- Then start changing it
  - Again, as a small change



### Changes the company DNA

#### Changes Product

😤 WIX

- No longer 2 months specification cycles
- Instead, ask what is the minimal useful feature set that we can open?
- How can we deploy it within a week?
- Work closely with developers to answer those questions
- Think small, fast, agile and about validating ideas with real users
- Decision making using A/B Testing and measurements
- Changes Operations
  - Don't do deployments it's the developer responsibility
  - DevOps mixes developers and system responsibilities
  - Responsible for Wix Runtime env
  - Can initiate rollback
  - Build the CD infra, guide developers, DRP, attacks, etc.



### Changes the company DNA

#### • Changes Developers

😤 WiX

- Responsible for building a product / feature
- Responsible from a product idea (with product) to development, testing (with QA developers) to deployment (with operations) to rollback (with monitoring and BI)
- DevOps work closely with operations to enable deployment and rollback, fully automated
- Work closely with product to find the best simple minimal product to build and validate

#### Changes Architects

- No longer making all the designs
- Instead, guides developers, works with system and dev, governs important designs (if we make a mistake, we can probably fix it fast)



### Where are we today?

- We have re-written our flash editor product as an HTML 5 editor
  - In just 4 months

**X**WiX

- We are introducing Wix 3<sup>rd</sup> party applications (developers API)
  - In just 6 weeks
- We are easily replacing significant parts of our infrastructure
- And we are doing 9.5 releases a day!
  - Number of Releases per day





#### Tools - App-info

• Application Dashboard

**X**WX

- Application Information, usage and errors on every server

Vix Framev	work App-Ir	nfo Dashboard	l - Wix Ed	itor Serv	/er						
Dashboar	d Managed Se	rvices Included Art	tifacts Full S	tack Trace Sr	apshot						
oplication Inf	formation				Usage	Summ	arv				
tle	Wix Editor	Server			Total C	alls				13994	
tifact	wix-editor-	-war			Total S	uccessful	l calls			13879	
rsion	1.95.0				Throug	hput				1,189.3 rpm	
ld	70f74f3f14	45a9be996376a355a9	6a0af01c9d59	7	Averag	e Respon	se Time			64.3 mSec	
ld Timestamp	20120126	-1309			Error Ra	ate				0.01 %	
)time 11:46				System	Errors				2/0/0/63		
ver Startup	26/01/201	2 07:54:21.058			Busines	s Errors				4/4/42/0	
rver Current Tin	ne 26/01/201	2 08:06:07.950									
thod	Facada valand fila				Rollina	alls A 1,598	verage 8.7 mSec	Max 255.9 m	Syste	m Errors Busi	iness Errors 0/0/21/0
w.e.u.StaticGrid	Facade.uploadFile				Last	1,598	8.7 mSec	200.9 m	- 15ec	0/0/0/0	0/0/21/0
v.e.s.PremiumSe	ervice.getPremium	Privileged			Rolling Last	939 0	4.5 mSec	202.7 m	1Sec -	0/0/0/0 -	0/1/0/0
0.00%		100.00%		Exception						Distribu	ution
				c.w.e.e.Site	DoesNotB	elongToU	IserException				(100%) 1
10.00%		10.00%									
1.00%		1.00%									
1.00 /0		1.00 /0									
0.10%	┟┲┨────┤	0.10%									
0.01%	┍┻┎╸┰╶┰╶┥	0.01%									
0.100 - 0.316	< 0.001	0.100 - 0.316	< 0.001								
0.316 - 1.00	0.001 - 0.003	0.316 - 1.00	0.001 - 0.003								
3.16 - 10.0	0.010 - 0.032	3.16 - 10.0	0.010 - 0.032								
> 10.0	0.032 - 0.100	> 10.0	0.032 - 0.100								
lling Usage St	atistics	Last Usage Statisti	CS	Error Distrib	oution						
ie E	Exception		Message					errorCode	process	callType	severity
/01/2012			Site with	id cb6ad4d5-2	5a3-e4c9	6e05-e0	d3dbac5c41		delete		
:03:38.826	c.w.e.e.SiteDoesN	otBelongToUserExcep	tion does not	belong to use	r with gui	d b14a6b	0f-6cfb-4fcf-	-9904	premium	BUSINESS_ERR	OR WARNING
			96c1-c3d4	103630012							

0\_0

### Tools - App-info

• Self-Test –

**X**WiX

- Can my application function?

Wix Framewo	rk App-Info Dashboard - Publ	ic Htn	nl R	enderer WAR		
Dashboard	Managed Services Included Artifacts Fi	ull Stack 1	Trace	Snapshot		
Application Inform	mation			Usage Summary		
Title	Public Html Renderer WAR			Total Calls	0	
Artifact	wix-public-html-renderer-webapp			Total Successful calls	ů.	
Version	2.5.0-SNAPSHOT			Throughput	0.0 rpm	
3uild	f4b29e25654767cf24175e56e010f152a24c	eala		Average Response Time	-	
Build Timestamp	20120125-1057			Error Rate	0.00 %	
Jptime .	32:3			System Errors	-	
Server Startup	25/01/2012 10:31:20.739			Business Errors	-	
Server Current Time	25/01/2012 13:03:24.616					
Server Time Zone	Europe/Amsterdam					
				c.w.h.r.s.MobileHtmlRendererBeansConfig\$MobileH	tmlRenderer	
c.w.h.r.s.MobileHtmlRendererBeansConfig\$MobileHtmlRenderer - mobileHtmlRenderer		true	false	Caused by: ModelProcessorChain - dependencies Caused by: ScriptsHtmlModelProcessor Caused by: failed loading scripts from source [http://static.crispy.wixpress.com/services/wix-express-mobile/1.42.14/index caused by c.w.h.r.s.ScriptSourceFailedLoadingScriptsException - failed loading scripts from [http://static.crispy.wixpress.com/services/wix-express- mobile/1.42.14] caused by c.w.h.r.s.ScriptSourceFailedLoadingScriptsException - failed loading caused by c.w.h.r.s.ScriptSourceFailedLoadingScriptsException - failed loading ScriptsFailedLoading		
				scripts from [http://static.crispy.wixpress. mobile/1.42.14]	.com/services/wix-express-	
c.w.h.r.s.FacebookHtmlRendererBeansConfig\$FacebookHtmlRenderer - facebookHtmlRenderer			false	Caused by: ModelProcessorChain - dependencies Caused by: ScriptsHtmlModelProcessor Caused by: failed loading scripts from source [http://static.crispy.wixpress.com/services/html-wysiwyg/1.0.0/index.json] caused by c.w.h.r.s.ScriptSourceFailedLoadingScriptsException - failed loading scripts from [http://static.crispy.wixpress.com/services/html-wysiwyg/1.0.0] caused by c.w.h.r.s.ScriptSourceFailedLoadingScriptsException - failed loading scripts from [http://static.crispy.wixpress.com/services/html-wysiwyg/1.0.0]		
				c.w.h.r.s.WebSeoRendererBeansConfig\$WebSeoR Caused by: ModelProcessorChain - dependencies	lenderer	



#### **Tools - New Relic**

• External Monitoring of applications

**XWX** 

Applications 🗊 Servers New! 📑 Custom views 🔹	S Tools -		
🔵 wix-editor 👻 🖷 App server 👻 Overview Map	New! Web transactions Database External services JVMs Back	ground tasks	🕗 Last 30 minutes 🕶
Average response time, broken down by tier (ms)	Average: 169 ms	Apdex score 🔞	0.95 [0.5]
250		1	
200		0.9	×
150		0.8	
		Throughput (rpm)	Average: 2,046
		2500	$\sim$
50		2000	$\sqrt{-}$
0 07:45 07:50	07:55 08:00 08:05	1500	08:00
MVL	Database Web External	01.50	
	New Relic	Compare with yesterday and last	week
Slow transactions → Resp. Tin	e <b>Errors</b> → Count	Recent events	5
/dispacher 27,779 n 08:08 — 3 minutes ago	s com.wixpress.framework.rpc.client.exceptions.RpcTranspc 120 /dispacher 120	All 🎪 🖂 🛑 🔺 💁 🚄	: Q 🕘
/dispacher 3,861 n 08:04 — 7 minutes ago	s com.wixpress.framework.dao.EntityNotFoundException 15 /dispacher	TODAY	
/dispacher 7,021 n 08:04 — 8 minutes ago	s com.wixpress.editor.exceptions.SiteDoesNotBelongToUse 13 /dispacher	4:20 ▲ Apdex score < 0.85 wix-editor →	
/dispacher 5,194 n 07:48 — 23 minutes ago	s com.wixpress.framework.security.WixSessionExpiredExcel 13 /dispacher	3:01 Apdex score < 0.85	
/dispacher 5,990 n 07:46 — 25 minutes ago	s com.wixpress.framework.validation.WixValidationExceptior 9 /dispacher	YESTERDAY ····································	
Show all slow transactions	→ Show all errors →	15:53 ▲ Apdex score < 0.85 wix-editor →	
6 servers → 📕 🔯 🔺 Apdex score 🖬 🗧	$Resp.time\ \Leftrightarrow\qquad Throughput\ \Leftrightarrow\qquad CPU\ usage\ \Leftrightarrow\qquad Memory\ \Leftrightarrow$	11:27 Apdex score < 0.85	



#### Tools - Chix

#### Staging Environments manager

**X**WX

Self-service deployment to staging environments

answers (1 13 0)	Production
backoffice (2.48.0-SNAPSHOT)	Snanshot
billing (2 77 0-SNAPSHOT)	Snanshot
blog (1.62.0)	Production
	Production
	Production
connect_statics (1.58.0)	Production
dashboard (1.1.0 SN 79)	Snapshot
dashboard_statics (1.3.0 SN 33)	Snapshot -
editor_renderer (1.90.0 SN 14)	Snapshot 💌
html (2.1.22)	RC 💌
html_web_skins (1.0.0)	Production -
html_wysiwyg_static (1.0.0)	Production -
inventory (NULL)	Production -
lists (NULL)	Production 💌
meta_site_manager (1.16.0 SN 3)	Snapshot 💌
meta_site_public (1.18.0 SN 5)	Snapshot 💌
mobile (NULL)	Snapshot 💌
mobile_client (1.42.14)	Production 💌
new_editor (1.96.0 SN 1)	Snapshot 💌
new_users (2.85.0)	Production 💌
private_media (1.16.0)	Production
prospero (1.36.0)	Production 💌
public (2.128.0)	Production
public_api (1.17.0)	Production -



#### **Tools - Lifecycle**

Centralized Dashboard

🗶 WIX

- Release RC, GA, Production (with Artifactory, TeamCity)
- Build status, production status (with chef, sous-chef)

#### Wix LifeCycle

#### View Logout





**X**WIX



